MINUTES OF THE LOUISIANA ARCHITECTS SELECTION BOARD September 10, 2019

A meeting of the Louisiana Architects Selection Board (LASB) was held in the Claiborne Building, 1201 N. Third Street, Room 1-136C, Baton Rouge, Louisiana 70802 on September 10, 2019.

The meeting was called to order at 10:00 a.m. by Mr. Michael Hunley, Chairman. Those members present were: Mr. Mark Moses, Ms. Kristine Kobila, Mr. Michael Hunley, Mr. Benjamin Bradford, Mr. David Abrams, Mr. Brent Baumbach and Ms. Lisa Smeltzer. Those members absent were: none. Also present as Legal Counsel was Mr. Rick McGimsey.

The first item of business was the adoption of the July 1, 2019 meeting minutes. Mr. Baumbach moved to adopt the minutes, and Mr. Bradley seconded the motion. With no opposition, the July 1, 2019 meeting minutes were adopted.

The next item of business was to ask for any public comments. Mr. Moses reported that the proposed new Selection Board rules would be promulgated in the Louisiana Register on September 20, 2019.

The next item of business was the selection of designers.

Ducio et # 1 Firms				Nominatio	n Ballot				
Project # 1 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total
G – Hellmuth, Obata & Kassabaum + Washer Hill Lipscomb Cabaniss Architecture, AJV	3	3		3	Recused	1	2	3	15
D – Eskew Dumez Ripple	2	2	2	2			1	2	11
I – Coleman Partners Architects Perkins and Will, AJV	1	1						1	3
E – Blitch Knevel Architects/Leblanc & Young Architects, AJV						3			3
C – Bradley-Blewster & Associates in association with HDR, Inc.						2			2
B – Prevot Design Services, Sutton Beebe Babin Architects & Somdal Associates, AJV			3	1			3		7
H – Newman Marchive, Inc. + Grace Hebert Curtis Architects, AJV			1						1

Item #1: Center for Medical Education and Wellness, LSU Health Sciences Center, Shreveport, Louisiana; Project No. 19-604S-15-01, F.19002219; Mr. Tony Lombardo gave a brief scope of the project; votes were recorded as follows:

Dec to at # 1 Eterror				Interview	Ballot				
Project # 1 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total
G – Hellmuth, Obata & Kassabaum + Washer Hill Lipscomb Cabaniss Architecture, AJV	Y	Y	Y	Y	Recused	Y	Y	Y	7
D – Eskew Dumez Ripple	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	7
B – Prevot Design Services, Sutton Beebe Babin Architects & Somdal Associates, AJV	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	7
E – Blitch Knevel Architects/Leblanc & Young Architects	Ν	Ν	Y	Y		Y	Y	N	4
I – Coleman Partners Architects Perkins and Will, AJV	Y	Y	Y	Y		Ν	Y	Y	6

Roll Call Voting for Interview

These five firms received a majority vote and were invited to give a presentation on September 26, 2019. Mrs. Daina Kroll, Board Secretary, will send additional information to each firm.

Item #2: Demolition, Brown Building and New Science Building, Southern University of New Orleans, New Orleans, Louisiana; Project No. 01-107-05B-13, F.01003913; Mr. Eli Guillory, III gave a brief scope of the project; votes were recorded as follows:

Project # 2 Firm				Nominatio	n Ballot				
Project # 2 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total
L – Manning Architects	3	3	3				3	3	15
G – GD Architecture, LLC							2	2	4
C – Jerry M. Campbell & Associates, AIA								1	1
K – VergesRome Architects, APAC	2	2				3	1		8
A – Ehlinger & Associates, P.C.	1	1		1					3
D – Didier Architecture, LLC						2			2
Q – Fusion Architecture, APC						1			1
F – Yeates & Yeates Architects, LLC					3				3
P – RCL Architecture, LLC			2	2	2				6
H – Meyer Engineers, Ltd.					1				1
J – Sizeler Thompson Brown Architects				3					3
I – Jahncke & Burns Architects, LLC			1						1

Final Ballot between Firm L and Firm K

				Final B	allot				
Project # 2 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total
L – Manning Architects	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х		Х	Х	7
K – VergesRome Architects, APAC						Х			1

The Firm of Manning Architects was selected by written majority vote.

Item #3: Demolition, Drew Hall Complex (Buildings 1-9), Dunbar Hall, and A.C. Lewis Library, Grambling State University, Grambling, Louisiana; Project No. 01-107-18-02, Part F.01003917; Mr. Fred Carr gave a brief scope of the project; votes were recorded as follows:

				Nominatio	n Ballot				
Project # 3 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total
D – Newman Marchive Incorporated	2	2			1	1	2	3	11
H – Architecture Associates, APC	1	1	3	3	3			2	13
G – DB Architecture of Acadiana, LLC							1	1	2
F - mcnew Architecture	3	3							6
C – Thomas W. Hatten, Architect			2	2	2	3			9
I-iArchitecture, LLC			1			2	3		6
E – Manning Architects				1					1

Final Ballot between Firm D and Firm H

Ducient # 2 Finm		Final Ballot									
Project # 3 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total		
D – Newman Marchive Incorporated	Х	Х				Х	Х	Х	5		
H – Architecture Associates, APC			Х	Х	Х				3		

The Firm of Newman Marchive Incorporated was selected by written majority vote.

Item #4: Demolition, Harper Hall and the TH Harris Building, Louisiana Tech University, Ruston, Louisiana; Project No. 01-107-18-02, F.01003912; Mr. Sam Wallace gave a brief scope of the project; votes were recorded as follows:

Ducient # 4 Finm				Nominatio	n Ballot				
Project # 4 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total
C – Newman Marchive Incorporated					3	1	2	3	9
D – Tipton Associates/Ashe Broussard Weinzettle, AJV	3	3	1	3	1	2	1	2	16
F-iArchitecture, LLC	2	2	3	2		3	3	1	16
A – Barras Architects	1	1							2
B – Thomas W. Hatten, Architect			2	1	2				5

Final Ballot between Firm D and Firm F

		Final Ballot								
Project # 4 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total	
D – Tipton Associates/Ashe Broussard Weinzettle, AJV	Х	Х		Х				X	4	
F – iArchitecture, LLC			Х		Х	Х	Х		4	

Final Tiebreaker Ballot between Firm D and Firm F

				Final Tiebrea	ker Ballo	t			
Project # 4 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total
D – Tipton Associates/Ashe Broussard Weinzettle, AJV	X	Х		Х		Х		X	5
F – iArchitecture, LLC			Х		Х		Х		3

The Firm of Tipton Associates/Ashe Broussard Weinzettle, AJV was selected by written majority vote.

Item #5: Reroof Comparative Biology, Utilities, & Central Store, Pennington Biomedical Research Center, Louisiana State University, Baton Rouge, Louisiana; Project No. 01-107-15-04, F.01003894 and 19-609-07S-01, Part F.19002285; Mr. Tony Lombardo gave a brief scope of the project; votes were recorded as follows:

Ducient # 5 Firm				Nominatio	n Ballot				
Project # 5 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total
F – GD Architecture, LLC						Recused	1	3	4
C – Jerry M. Campbell & Associates, AIA								2	2
T – Post Architects, LLC	3	3	2	2			2	1	13
S – Fusion Architecture, APC	2	2	1	1	3				9
P-BCB Architects, LLC	1	1					3		5
G – BE-CI, Inc. & Neal Johnson LLC, AJV					2				2
J – Cockfield Jackson Architects, APAC				3	1				4
N – Mougeot Architecture, LLC			3						3

Final Ballot between Firm T and Firm S

		Final Ballot							
Project # 5 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total
T – Post Architects, LLC	Х	Х	Х	Х		Recused	Х	Х	6
S – Fusion Architecture, APC					Х				1

The Firm of Post Architects, LLC was selected by written majority vote.

Item #6: New Billeting (Trousdale House Replacement), Camp Beauregard Training Center, Pineville, Louisiana; Project No. LA20-A-015; Brigadier General (Ret) Owen Monconduit gave a brief scope of the project; votes were recorded as follows:

Ducient # 6 Finm	-			Nominatio	n Ballot				
Project # 6 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total
F – James Guillory Architect, LLC & Ballard CLC, Inc. – A Joint Venture	3	3	3	2	2	3	3	3	22
B – Alliance Design Group, LLC			1	3		2	1	2	9
D – KSA Engineers, Inc.	1	1			1		2	1	6
K – SO/Studio (Lafayette)	2	2	2	1	3				10
C – Hoffpauir Studio, LLC						1			1

Final Ballot between Firm F and Firm K

	Final Ballot								
Project # 6 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total
F – James Guillory Architect, LLC & Ballard CLC, Inc. – A Joint Venture	Х	Х	Х	Х		Х	Х	X	7
K – SO/Studio (Lafayette)					Х				1

The Firm of James Guillory Architect, LLC & Ballard CLC, Inc. – A Joint Venture was selected by written majority vote.

Item #7: Reroof, Earl K. Long Library, Sections B, C, and E, University of New Orleans, New Orleans, Louisiana; Project No. 01-107-15-04, Part F.01003871; Ms. Deborah Leitz Hadaway gave a brief scope of the project; votes were recorded as follows:

		Nomination Ballot							
Project # 7 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total
N – VergesRome Architects, APAC	2	2					3	3	10
S – Mathes Brierre Architects, APC			3			3		2	8
F – Yeates & Yeates Architects, LLC				2	3		2	1	8
L – Houston J. Lirette, Jr., APAC	3	3							6
B – Ehlinger & Associates, P.C.	1	1		3			1		6
G – John C. Williams Architects, LLC					2	2			4
E – N-Y Associates, Inc.						1			1
R – RCL Architecture, LLC					1				1
H – Holly & Smith Architects, APAC				1					1
T – Albert Architecture & Urban Design			2						2
P – Koch and Wilson Architects, APC			1						1

Tiebreaker Ballot for 2nd Place between Firm S and Firm F

		Tiebreaker Ballot for 2 nd Place								
Project #7 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total	
S – Mathes Brierre Architects, APC	Х	Х	Х			Х		Х	5	
F – Yeates & Yeates Architects, LLC				Х	Х		X		3	

Final Ballot between Firm N and Firm S

Project # 7 Firm	Final Ballot								
Project # 7 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total
N – VergesRome Architects, APAC	Х	Х		Х	Х		Х	Х	6
S – Mathes Brierre Architects, APC			Х			Х			2

The Firm of VergesRome Architects, APAC was selected by written majority vote.

Item #8: Reroof, Prescott Memorial Library and Wyly Tower of Learning, Louisiana Tech University, Ruston, Louisiana; Project No. 01-107-15-04, F.01003909; Mr. Sam Wallace gave a brief scope of the project; votes were recorded as follows:

Duciest # 9 Firms				Nominatio	n Ballot				
Project # 8 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total
F – mcnew Architecture, APAC	3	3	3		1		2	3	15
D – KSA Engineers, Inc.	1	1				1	1	2	6
B – Whittington Architects, Inc.	2	2	2	3	3	3		1	16
E – Thomas W. Hatten, Architect				2	2	2			6
I – Griggs Mitchell and Assoc., Architecture, LLC				1					1
H – iArchitecture, LLC			1				3		4

Final Ballot between Firm F and Firm B

		Final Ballot							
Project # 8 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total
F – mcnew Architecture, APAC	Х	Х	X				Х	Х	5
B – Whittington Architects, Inc.				Х	Х	Х			3

The Firm of mcnew Architecture, APAC was selected by written majority vote.

Item #9: Roof Replacements, Multiple Buildings, Louisiana Special Education Center, Alexandria, Louisiana; Project No. 19-655-17-01, F.19002216; Ms. Kristy Flynn gave a brief scope of the project; votes were recorded as follows:

Ducient # 0 Firm	Nomination Ballot									
Project # 9 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total	
B – Alliance Design Group, LLC	3	3	2	3	1	2	3	3	20	
F – Ashe Broussard Weinzettle Architects			3	1		1	2	2	9	
E – BBI Architects, AAC (Baton Rouge)	1	1		2	2		1	1	8	
C – Barras Architects	2	2			3				7	
A – Ardoin Architecture, LLC			1			3			4	

Final Ballot between Firm B and Firm F

		Final Ballot							
Project # 9 Firm	Moses	Smeltzer	Hunley	Baumbach	Kobila	Bradford	Abrams	User	Total
B – Alliance Design Group, LLC	Х	Х		Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	7
F – Ashe Broussard Weinzettle Architects			Х						1

The Firm of Alliance Design Group, LLC was selected by written majority vote.

There being no further business, Mr. Baumbach moved to adjourn the meeting. It was seconded by Mr. Abrams. There being no opposition, the meeting was adjourned at 11:14 a.m.